

LEARNING FROM THREE INNOVATIVE POLICE- PARTNERSHIP PRACTICES FROM MIDDLE INCOME COUNTRIES THAT HELP PREVENT VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN

**A review to extract lessons for innovative police-
partnership practices**

By Dr. Richard Griggs



This report was designed to stimulate discussion at a breakfast club briefing and was constructed from available web-based information. If any of the practices are of particular interest to the reader, additional research is recommended.

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	3
The Breakfast Club Methodology	3
How we located the practices to review	4
1. ALL WOMEN POLICE STATIONS (AWPS)	6
The Geography of AWPS	8
AWPS in Brazil	9
Indicators Of Success	13
What Resources Are Required For Implementing AWPS?	17
Concluding Comments On AWPS	19
2. THE PARIVARTAN PROJECT IN DELHI—WOMEN CONSTABLES ON THE BEAT	21
Organisation And Management Of VAW Constables	23
Collaboration	23
Success Rates	24
3. MOBILE DOMESTIC VIOLENCE RESPONSE UNITS	26
Organisation And Management Of Mobile Domestic Violence Units	28
Collaboration	29
Success Rates	30
Training	31
Resources	31
EXTRACTING THE LEARNING FROM THREE PRACTICES	32
A BRIEF CONCLUSION	34

INTRODUCTION

This paper reviews three police-partnership practices which were innovative and successful at reducing Violence Against Women (VAW) in a large number of countries. The idea of the paper is NOT to promote any particular practices but to analyse them and extract from them: (a) why they worked; (b) what was innovative and (c) what can be learnt for practice in South Africa (SA). If innovation elsewhere sparks some new ideas, opens up dialogue or simply engenders new partnerships then we have succeeded in our mission as the Breakfast Club.¹ We are essentially a research organisation that wants to improve service delivery by furnishing information on innovative practices in cooperative governance and today we are concerned with innovation in terms of police-partnership practices to address a crime and violence problem that does not seem to be abating—VAW.

The Breakfast Club Methodology

Our methodology is to research some innovative practices from around the world that are not being practiced here with regard to some major crime issues (or possibly other topical issues in the future) and then bring stakeholders together to see if the exploration and discussion of these ideas can spur innovative practices and partnerships here or else open up new dialogue about existing practices. The insights are then presented in a breakfast briefing² and the feedback at that session is then integrated into the original research/presentation materials to issue a paper

¹The SAPS statistics for 2010-2011 indicated that the number of counts of violent crime against women and children rose enormously in terms of attempted murder and all sexual offences (e.g., a 19.8% increase in sexual offences against adult women) despite drops in many other categories of crime

² The organisation will also continue after such presentations to meet with some key stakeholders and work with them to see that innovative practices are incorporated when and where they have value and application in South Africa.

that is published on our website (www.iicg.org.za) and distributed to participants. Thus, this paper is the product of the presentation and comments that were recorded at the first breakfast Club meeting on 21 June at the Cape Town Royal Yacht Club.

How we located the practices to review

The first criteria was to locate practices from countries either poorer than South Africa or of the same economic standing such that it could not be argued that affordability prevents us from piloting any of these ideas. The World Bank classifies the wealth of countries and this list was consulted to find that South Africa is rated as neither rich nor poor but as Upper Middle Income.³

Secondly, the author, with 20-years of experience in crime prevention research, reflected on the components of a good strategy and then analysed the South African situation to identify some gaps in practice. FIGURE ONE (below) lists some of the broad and basic requirements of good practice in the left-hand column and some indications of how well SA satisfies these requirements in the two columns to the right.

³ World Bank List of Economies (November 2011)

FIGURE ONE**SUGGESTED REQUIREMENTS OF GOOD PRACTICE TO PREVENT VAW**

SUGGESTED REQUIREMENT	DOES SA HAVE THIS?	GAPS
National legislation	Yes	None
The criminalisation of VAW	Yes	None
Development of standardised protocol for responding to VAW	Within departments but not always between them	There is not always a well-coordinated approach between stakeholders
Rehabilitation of survivors	Yes/No	Civil society partners mainly provide for this (e.g., NICRO has programmes)
Reporting structures that make it easy and encouraging for women to report	Yes/No	There are reporting structures via police but many women feel discouraged about reporting
Multi-sectored, multidisciplinary and coordinated rapid response	Very weak	This can occur and there are referral systems but really integrated responses (e.g., mobile unit response teams) are not common at all
Strategies aimed at behaviour change	Very weak	No concerted national campaign (requires coordination)

Of these suggested standards, three of the WEAKEST areas in South Africa seemed to be in terms of coordinated responses. Three innovative practices from around the world were then located by a web search that seemed to offer really good coordinated responses. These are described below to spark discussion and new ideas about how to address that gap in the context of combating VAW. The three discussed practices collectively point to what works in any strategy (as discussed in the conclusion) but we are neither trying to promote or demote these specific methods:

- **ALL WOMEN POLICE STATIONS:** could some elements of a strategy that spread like wildfire across Latin America since the 1980s and Asia since 1995 be applied here?
- **WOMEN CONSTABLES ON THE BEAT:** could this approach based on women constables going door-to-door to provide information on how to drive down VAW levels work here just as it did in Delhi?
- **MOBILE RESPONSE UNITS:** could we group some key experts in a mobile response vehicle and send them immediately to the crime scene to ensure rapid multi-sectorial, multi-disciplinary and coordinated responses (a technique that has worked very effectively in some cities around the world)?

1. ALL WOMEN POLICE STATIONS (AWPS)⁴

Police stations staffed with multi-disciplinary female teams that respond to the needs of female survivors of violence have proliferated around the world and now thousands of these stations are spread across three continents in countries like India, Nepal, Philippines, Pakistan, Peru, Colombia, Nicaragua, Ecuador, Uruguay and many others. All Women Police Stations (AWPS) may or may not be viewed as a model to test in South Africa but reviewing how these function and understanding why they proliferated does locate particular practices that work and we can extract lessons from these without adopting the particular model.

Perhaps the chief value is that AWPS *increased access to justice* for women victims of severe gender-based violence.⁵ Based on all available evidence (as discussed

⁴ The best source of data for further study on this might be Jubb, Nadine et al (October 2010) *Women's Police Stations in Latin America: an entry point for stopping violence and gaining access to justice*, Centre for Planning and Social Studies, Quito, Ecuador, http://www.ceplaes.org.ec/AccesoJusticia/docs/CEPLAES_ingles.pdf

further below) it leads to an increase in the numbers who do report and *that* is the main objective of AWPS as a strategy. A sizeable number of female victims feel uncomfortable reporting to a man after certain kinds of crimes and for these particular victims, it gives them an additional and comfortable choice for reporting at a low cost. This tells us more generally that more sensitive case handling allows victims to get the help they require and increased levels of reporting translate into a more accurate understanding of the extent of the problem.

This model was reported to be successful at driving down VAW rates while being cost effective:

- Like South Africa, domestic violence rates were very high—a 2001 study by the Perseu Abramo Foundation showed that one-quarter of Brazilian women had been victims of physical attacks and one-third had suffered continuous verbal or psychological abuse but with AWPS these incidents reportedly dropped.⁶
- Cost effectiveness: according to Sociologist Cecilia MacDowell Santos of the University of San Francisco, “It was less expensive to have women’s police stations than to set up shelters.”⁷

Some discussion arose at the Breakfast Club that the AWPS experience might be a repetition of apartheid—increasing segregation—but there is actually no evidence to suggest this. Rather, it increases levels of service delivery to particular types of victims—in this case it is service to women who have just been

⁵ Jubb, Nadine et al (October 2010) *Women’s Police Stations in Latin America: an entry point for stopping violence and gaining access to justice*, Centre for Planning and Social Studies, Quito, Ecuador,
http://www.ceplaes.org.ec/AccessoJusticia/docs/CEPLAES_ingles.pdf

⁶ Downie, Andrew (20 July 2005), ‘A Police Station of their Own’, Christian Science Monitor
<http://www.csmonitor.com/2005/0720/p15s02-woam.htm>

⁷ Downie, Andrew (20 July 2005), ‘A Police Station of their Own’, Christian Science Monitor
<http://www.csmonitor.com/2005/0720/p15s02-woam.htm>

traumatically violated by men—and making provisions so that they can report to a female officer instead of a male officer IF that feels more comfortable *to them*. It is an *additional* choice in reporting rather than a compulsory system to force all women into one kind of reporting structure.

The Geography of AWPS

In terms of global geography, the AWPS are currently concentrated in three world regions: Latin America, South Asia and South East Asia. Economically, this finds most AWPS amongst middle income countries like our own or poorer and examples in Europe or North America were not found although that is not to say that none exist. There is also a related model in many developing nations (including many in African countries) in terms of established Gender Desks at police stations run by trained women who help victims of sexual violence (this strategy also improves reporting and response times and is recommended by the United Nations).⁸ Some of these gender desks include private offices for discreet reporting and this could be the ‘kernel’ of developing an AWPS model but these gender desks are not quite as encompassing in terms of collaboration and execution as an All Women’s Police Facility.

Interestingly, the idea of AWPS did not spread from one continent to the other but arose independently in two parts of the world to result in a Latin American Model and an Asian Model. In Latin America, Brazil had the first AWPS and this is highlighted below. The first AWPS in Asia was started in Tamil Nadu (South India) in 1991 when the Chief Minister of Police felt the need for an anti-dowry cell and then

⁸ Ombwori, Frederic (2009) “Status of Gender Desks at Police Stations in Kenya,” Institute of Economic Affairs Kenya <http://www.ieakenya.or.ke/documents/Status%20of%20Gender%20Desk%20in%20Police%20Stations%20Final.pdf>; Kimani, Mary (July 2007) “Taking on Violence Against Women in Africa,” *Africa Renewal*, Vol.21 #2 p, 4; <http://www.un.org/ecosocdev/geninfo/afrec/vol21no2/212-violence-aganist-women.html>; UN Women, ‘Establish Gender Desks,’ <http://www.endvawnow.org/en/articles/1061-establish-gender-desks-focal-points-units-within-security-institutions.html>

developed it into all women-police stations.⁹ It spread from there across India, Pakistan and to many other parts of Asia.¹⁰ Owing to the highly populated areas in which AWPS arose and spread, the reader should recognise that hundreds of millions of people are now being served by them and this alone is a good reason for anyone interested in crime prevention to at least explore this idea. In comparative terms, we will look only at Brazil:

- A country much bigger than South Africa (190 million people live within 26 federal states to constitute the fifth biggest country in the world in terms of area: 8,514,877 square kilometres¹¹), but the state where it was modelled, Sao Paulo, has the same population as South Africa (@45 million).¹²
- Brazil and South Africa are both Upper Middle Income countries although as of 2012 Brazil is just slightly wealthier in terms of GDP per capita.¹³

AWPS in Brazil

Brazil established the first AWPS in 1985, piloted it slowly, and then over a long period of time found that it worked so well that it funded the establishment of 300 of them altogether. In addition to that, women police stations proliferated across 14 Latin American countries owing to the perceived success in Brazil (and another 15 countries worldwide).

⁹ Police Department Tamil Nadu (2004) <http://www.tn.gov.in/policynotes/archives/policy2004-05/pol2004-05-3.htm>

¹⁰ Mooney, Joyce (2005) <http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/pdf/10.1086/510045>

¹¹ Wikipedia, List of Brazilian States by Area (2007) [p://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_Brazilian_states_by_area](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_Brazilian_states_by_area); Rosenberg, Matt (2008) <http://geography.about.com/cs/worldpopulation/a/mostpopulous.htm>; [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/S%C3%A3o_Paulo_\(state\)](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/S%C3%A3o_Paulo_(state))

¹² Mooney, Joyce (2005) <http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/pdf/10.1086/510045>

¹³ Wikipedia (2012) [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_countries_by_GDP_\(PPP\)_per_capita](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_countries_by_GDP_(PPP)_per_capita); World Bank List of Economies (November 2011)

How was the Brazilian model organised and managed? Brazilian women can go to any police station to report any crime including domestic violence and sexual assault but in many Brazilian states and most of all in the state of Sao Paulo where this phenomenon started there is a second choice: AWPS. These are not usually separate buildings but floors or areas in existing stations (to make this service prevalent and affordable). The waiting areas are also pleasant with children's rooms, television and refreshments. FIGURE TWO below illustrates some basic characteristics:

FIGURE TWO
BRAZIL'S ORGANISATION AND MANAGEMENT OF ITS WOMEN'S POLICE STATIONS

SERVICES	MANAGEMENT	SERVICE PROVIDERS	ESTABLISHED	MAIN ISSUES ADDRESSED
300+ AWPS in various states but Sao Paulo has most of them (the idea originated here)	Each of 26 states manages its own services (Brazil has a federal system)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Police ✓ Psychologists ✓ Legal assistance ✓ NGOs 	1985	Domestic violence, assault, threats, child abuse, sexual assault and any crime perpetrated against a woman, legal assistance, emotional support

For comparison, some key aspects of the organisation and management of the all-female police stations in India are illustrated in FIGURE THREE (below):

FIGURE THREE:**ORGANISATION AND MANAGEMENT OF AWPS IN TAMIL NADU (INDIA)**

DELIVERY OF SERVICES	MANAGEMENT OF SERVICES	COLLABORATION	ESTABLISHED	MAIN ISSUES ADDRESSED
200+ AWPS in Tamil Nadu and at least 100 more spread across several Indian states: Mobile Units for rural areas.	Managed independently by each state	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ NGOs ✓ Social Welfare, ✓ Department of Justice ✓ Revenue Office 	1991	Domestic violence, dowry issues, rape, polygamy, abuse, sexual harassment in the workplace or in public

The chief value of AWPS to highlight in any country is that having an AWPS offers a place that is perceived as:

- a) Safe to report
- b) Comfortable to report
- c) Offering the victim a way to achieve justice

The AWPS are hardly standardised so that one can speak of multiple forms for these facilities that adopt to local people, cultures and available resources. For instance, some of these stations have mobile units to reach the rural areas that include teams: a police officer, an advocate, a doctor, a social worker and a revenue department official travel to the crime site where together they identify and resolve crime problems immediately.¹⁴ In fact, mobile units are discussed separately as another idea further below but the aim of the mobile units is to increase the speed of a *coordinated* response. However, this does hint of the types of conclusions to

¹⁴ Chennai City Police (2008) <http://www.chennaicitypolice.org/women.htm>

draw from this IICG report: integrating the best aspects of all potential responses is really good strategy.

How independent are the AWPS? While this depends on the needs of each country, the AWPS in most parts of the world have their own budgets (the police are decentralised in many federal countries like Brazil) and include: specially trained officers to take complaints, detectives to investigate, and psychologists that provide 24 hour service in shifts *at the station*.

What kind of interdepartmental cooperation is involved? While Police, Justice and Health are the core partners in Brazilian facilities, the mix of partners varies by location both within Brazil and globally. Collaboration *evolves* differently in every place and is an evolutionary process that follows once decisions are taken to establish the model (perhaps just 2-3 partners work initially with police). For instance the first AWPS in Asia was established around 1991 at Chennai (Tamil Nadu) with very few partners.¹⁵ Then 10 years later (in 2000/2001) an NGO in Chennai called the International Foundation for Crime Prevention and Victim Care partnered to provide:

- Training in gender sensitivity and crisis management (for station members)
- Telephone help lines (installed from 2005 to allow for support and referrals)
- Trained coordinators at the police stations to give information on support services
- Awareness campaigns for violence-free, healthy and safe relationships

¹⁵ Chennai City Police (2008) <http://www.chennaicitypolice.org/women.htm>

- Networking with schools, colleges, clubs, residential welfare associations, newspapers, shops and businesses¹⁶

Today the original Tamil Nadu All-Women Police Stations have evolved to work with so many government partners, NGOs and volunteer organisations that just explaining this one site requires a thesis on its own. For instance, the employees of the Social Welfare Department are now attached directly to the stations. There are also District level Advisory committees chaired by the police that meet monthly. The participants of these meetings include Social workers, NGOs and Advocates (Justice).¹⁷ The point is that this partnership complexity does not occur overnight but evolves and yet this speaks well of the model—the model helps to attract enthusiastic partnerships and the add-ons just seem to ‘keep on coming’.

Indicators of success

Can the AWPS be regarded as successful? Yes--and six main lines of evidence can be suggested based on the review of the Latin American experience:

1. The first line of evidence on success is that the reporting of crimes against women at the AWPS was at least twice the rate reported at regular stations.¹⁸ This is the evidence that basically leads municipalities, provinces and states to keep building one AWPS after another.

¹⁶ Association for Women’s Rights and Development (07 July 2006), ‘Addressing Domestic Violence in India,’ <http://www.awid.org/go.php?stid=1625>

¹⁷ Chennai City Police (2008) <http://www.chennai-citypolice.org/women.htm>

¹⁸ Mooney, Joyce (2005) <http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/pdf/10.1086/510045>; Downie, Andrew (20 July 2005), ‘A Police Station of their Own’, Christian Science Monitor <http://www.csmonitor.com/2005/0720/p15s02-woam.htm>

2. The *number of charges filed* against those abusing women rises owing to the availability of an all-female police station to which women can comfortably report. In other words increased comfort in reporting also lead to charges being filed (this can help reduce the crime). According to the police chief at one of the first women police stations to open in Sao Paulo, Marcia Salgado, there was a “line down the block” because most women found it *much easier and more comfortable* to report to women police officers. “Women were coming to tell us about incidents from 20 years earlier.”¹⁹
3. There is evidence of improved police practice. Before the advent of women’s police stations in most places, the police did not investigate incidents of violence against women with the same rigour and sometimes even treated victims of sexual violence with indifference while today in countries having the women police stations; it is much more widely recognised as criminal behaviour constituting a violation of human rights.²⁰
4. The proliferation of the AWPS model across some 30 or so countries and ones with very large populations also suggests that it is appealing—there is eventual buy-in to the concept although people are not always quick to understand the concept properly. The first one was established in the 1980s and by 2012 these stations were spread widely over Latin America and Asia--more than a thousand in Latin America alone.
5. Since their establishment in the 1980s, the stations have been *sustained* in many part of the world and expanded upon to also indicate some recognition of effectiveness.

¹⁹ Downie, Andrew (20 July 2005), ‘A Police Station of their Own’, Christian Science Monitor
<http://www.csmonitor.com/2005/0720/p15s02-woam.htm>

²⁰ Htun, Mala (2002) ‘Puzzles of Women’s Rights in Brazil,’ <http://www.encyclopedia.com/doc/1G1-94227139.html>

6. Finally in some places they are associated with a drop in the murder rate. In one Sao Paulo study the murder rate dropped by 50% between 2000 and 2007 and while this was attributed to many factors, the women's police stations were listed as one factor (others were better crime data bases, better communication between military and civil police, new switchboards for citizen reporting of crimes, new community policing stations, new homicide combat units, more sophisticated software and a programme to rid the state of illegal firearms).²¹

With specific application to the AWPS in Asia, there are seven measures of success to highlight:

1. In 1992, in all of Asia there was one station in Chennai and today there are 300 such stations in Tamil Nadu alone (undoubtedly the investment was *perceived* to be worthwhile).
2. All over Asia, the number of reported cases went up owing to the presence of these stations.²²
3. When toll free lines were added to the offerings at the women's stations, the reporting rate of crimes against women and children rose by another 23%.²³
4. Women police stations have evolved to play a major role in settling domestic violence disputes generally using mediation to solve them but many will file a

²¹ Ted Goertzel and Túlio Kahn (10 June 2007) 'The Unsung Story of Sao Paulo's Murder Rate Drop,' 2007 http://news.newamericamedia.org/news/view_article.html?article_id=0a7ee25d39a7d2b0737cef8c76bc84b5

²² Association for Women's Rights and Development (07 July 2006), 'Addressing Domestic Violence in India,' <http://www.awid.org/go.php?stid=1625>

²³ Kandaswamy, Deepa and K. Deepa (Winter 2004) 'Indian Policewomen Practice Policing and Politicking,' <http://www.ms magazine.com/spring2005/indianpolicewomen.asp>

criminal case of cruelty or dowry harassment by the husband or *in-laws* if necessary.²⁴

5. Police women testify that the main impact of the AWPS is that their existence as an easy and comfortable place to report places pressure on men to control their behaviour, which in turn accounts for part of the reduction in cases of abuse and major reduction in repeat cases.²⁵
6. The increased reporting also creates permanent police records which contribute to improved male behaviour since once male offenders already have a police record it lessens their will to abuse their spouse (i.e., they become very concerned about the consequences of repeat offending).²⁶
7. In the 20 or so years that these AWPS have been operating in Asia cooperation between police and civil society has produced highly coordinated programmes that improve the way cases are handled by the police.²⁷

The second to last bullet above (bullet six) points to a particular success in the AWPS programme: men fear being prosecuted and therefore the AWPS has more of a *crime prevention impact* than a conviction impact. For instance, sexual harassment cases drop when men fear being arrested for it (knowing women have a place to report and that they do report). In Chennai, the number of harassment cases dropped below 100 in 2006 whereas in 2005 the number was more than 200.²⁸ Interestingly, there is actually little evidence in Asia that conviction rates rise

²⁴ Association for Women's Rights and Development (07 July 2006), 'Addressing Domestic Violence in India,' <http://www.awid.org/go.php?stid=1625>

²⁵ Ruiz, Rebecca (13 September 2006), 'India's All-Women Police Pursue Dowry Complaints,' <http://www.womensenews.org/article.cfm/dyn/aid/2886>

²⁶ Ruiz, Rebecca (13 September 2006), 'India's All-Women Police Pursue Dowry Complaints,' <http://www.womensenews.org/article.cfm/dyn/aid/2886>

²⁷ Ruiz, Rebecca (13 September 2006), 'India's All-Women Police Pursue Dowry Complaints,' <http://www.womensenews.org/article.cfm/dyn/aid/2886>

²⁸ Srikrishna, L. (2007) 'Harassment of Women Down, Dowry Deaths Up,' <http://www.thehindu.com/2007/03/02/stories/2007030218820300.htm>

owing to the AWPS. Instead the impact is that *harassment of women drops* owing to the prevention impact.²⁹

What Resources Are Required For Implementing AWPS?

The initial implementation of AWPS in most places is NOT expensive. In many places, the police simply wall off an existing part of the station and give it a separate entrance for women who want to report to women police officers owing to a domestic violence problem or a sexual assault. It was only over a long period of time as the success of the AWPS became obvious--measured initially in terms of increased reporting levels--that separate stations developed in certain locations. Furthermore, specialisation also evolves and is not part of the offering from day one but over time and especially in urban areas where people with specialised skills start to partner with the stations as if it were a magnet. In the evolved areas of AWPS one sees many professionals and facilities so that these act as one-stop centres with complete access to legal, medical and psychological services. Often this is a result of collaboration between NGOs and government departments. Perhaps one point for South African practice is that once an innovative practice takes off, it can be evolutionary and evolve in its own appropriate ways according to the place (as long as we are willing to be innovative!). The starting point can be rather simple too (just wall off a section of a station and test it in one pilot site).

The human resource allocations for a Sao Paulo facility grew from just one police woman on duty to this kind of set up after a few years:

²⁹ Srikrishna, L. (2007) 'Harassment of Women Down, Dowry Deaths Up,' <http://www.thehindu.com/2007/03/02/stories/2007030218820300.htm>

- Three professional psychologists on 24-hour call who work directly with both victims and police (In fact, judges in Brazil offer accused men the option of counselling or therapy sessions)
- A senior officer (the 'Delgada')
- Four specially trained officers to take complaints
- Five detectives to investigate reported abuses
- Eight offices
- A waiting area with TV, coffee machine and a children's play room
- A legal advice officer (usually the only male on the premises if there is one)³⁰

In Asia, the women who staff the stations are trained at station level (such that training varies). They are also ordinarily trained to:

- Field all complaints to police related to domestic violence
- Use both the law and the pressure of social embarrassment to constrain the behaviour of husbands and to remind them of what is acceptable in legal terms (which may be contrary to cultural perspectives)
- Offer gender sensitive counselling to *both* men and women

The main resource required for the AWPS is an independent area or space for the investigation of crimes against women staffed by women police but in Asia especially the model evolved to offer independent facilities sometimes physically

³⁰ Downie, Andrew (20 July 2005), 'A Police Station of their Own', Christian Science Monitor <http://www.csmonitor.com/2005/0720/p15s02-woam.htm>

bifurcated from what was once a single station. Each has considerable resources even in a situation of relative poverty (when compared to South Africa):

- All available resources at 300 or more all-women police stations in India (vehicles, supplies, stationery, etc.) are dedicated to women and children's issues.
- Each station also has a counselling centre for women and children victims.
- Some rural stations are equipped with mobile counselling centres to offer the victims home-based visits.³¹
- There are also two toll-free help lines—Women in Distress and Child in Distress—through which anonymous complaints are pursued.³²
- They also provide residential quarters for inspectors and constables.³³

Concluding Comments On AWPS

At the breakfast briefing a few participants voiced fear that such a model would make VAW an all women issue. Interestingly, in all places where AWPS was tried there were such fears initially such that SA is not really different (e.g., AWPS viewed as a form of separatism) but it is actually an additional choice in reporting structures and never in any place where it has ever been tried did it lead to segregated policing. Based on the Latin American experience since 1985 or the Asian one since the early 1990s, the best way forward is to pilot it first at a small scale and then make a judgment. In all cases so far there has been a huge and indisputable

³¹ Tamil Nadu Police (2 April 2007) 'Policy Note' http://www.tn.gov.in/policynotes/archives/policy2006-07/police_1.htm

³² Chennai City Police (2008) <http://www.chennaicitypolice.org/women.htm>

³³ Chennai City Police (2008) <http://www.chennaicitypolice.org/women.htm>

increase in reporting and more sensitive treatment of particular issues for women (women do not report to the AWPS for all issues!) and that seems to overcome resistance to the AWPS idea in nearly every country where it was tried.

It is also evident that piloting the model can be relatively inexpensive. When these stations were being built per capita income in India was much LOWER than in South Africa (\$5000 per capita versus \$750).³⁴ Thus, establishing women police stations in South Africa might be more of a policy choice than a financial one and either way testing it out as an innovative approach should not really be a problem. To see if it works to increase reporting, all that is required is a separate facility in a police station with police women attending and at later stages based on the success of the project, additional services are added gradually until they constitute an offering of diverse services. The model would evolve differently in SA to take into account our different cultures, systems and resources. So, it might be well worth some piloting or otherwise just adapting some of the key elements that work (this latter approach is the focus of the concluding section of this paper).

³⁴ GNP per capita@Countries of the World (2005) <http://www.studentsoftheworld.info/infopays/rank/PNBH2.html>

2. THE PARIVARTAN PROJECT IN DELHI—WOMEN CONSTABLES ON THE BEAT³⁵

This refers to a coordinated all-female response and prevention team operating at street level. South Africa does not have anything like this but it should be noted that SAPS does have some all-women operational teams in various areas of the country—so it is not such a stretch for us to understand the Parivartan model.³⁶ This Parivartan project evolved from research, which showed that male police officers were lacking some of the sensitivities required to deal with women victims and still required much orientation and training on gender issues. So while training the male police officers in Delhi—which was part of the intervention too—female constables were deployed to regular beats or patrols in targeted high crime areas for VAW. They patrol hotspots and conduct door-to-door awareness campaigns. In India one also finds the All Women Police stations and there are reports that the two systems work well together.

The idea initially emerged from crime mapping and analysis that identified 20 beats out of 200 beats in the North-West District where most of the sexual violence, particularly rape was occurring. For the first phase of the intervention female constables (two per beat) were focused on (a) patrolling the roads, bus-stands, parks, sub-ways and other 'HOT SPOTS' that were known to be unsafe for women based on crime mapping; and (b) educating women door-to-door about these safety issues. The effort succeeded and expanded to more than the initial 20 beats.

The Parivartan system also grew much more complex than just sending women on patrol but became a multi-layered effort with the women patrols at the core of it. The two female constables in each beat are also supported by 20 trained women

³⁵ Most of this data was located on the Delhi Police Website: <http://www.delhipolice.nic.in/parivartan/parivartan.htm>

³⁶ South African Police Service, "Police Women Breaking New Ground," http://www.saps.gov.za/womensnetwork/news_police_women.htm

community members that act as community counsellors wherever problems are encountered during these door-to-door rounds. This leads to a referral system. Beyond this, there were various community programmes, workshops, lectures, pantomime shows and educational activities as part of the intervention such that the range of activities was also part of the perceived effectiveness of the effort. Between 2005 and 2008 activities included:

- 564 educational pantomime shows
- 487 showings of awareness-raising films
- 213 Women Safety Committee meetings
- 89 workshops in schools
- 38 male sensitisation courses
- 21 training orientation courses (police and other stakeholders)
- Scores to hundreds of media broadcasts (radio and TV)
- A mobile van with educational audio-visual and multimedia information cruised the communities offering information

The pantomime performances focusing on rape and sexual assault, domestic violence and dowry harassment were conducted before huge crowds. These were also interactive with the audience and resulted in cases being reported at these events that had not been previously reported. Establishing Women's Safety Committees enabled local residents to play an active role in disseminating information on the factors that give rise to violence against women and children and to encourage reporting. The educational campaigns and interventions to change patriarchal mind-sets and the efforts to increase reporting through various community-targeted programmes (see collaboration below) may help explain the drop in VAW during the period.

Organisation And Management Of VAW Constables

At the start of piloting, 40 women police constables were deployed in 20 beats under the supervision of a Deputy Commissioner of Police (the nodal officer). Supporting the constables in terms of conceptualising and implementing the intervention was a reference team of police officers, sociologists (from universities), doctors, lawyers, clinical psychologists and communication specialists.

Collaboration

The Parivartan Project was entirely collaborative from the start since the very idea of placing women constables on the beat emerged in July 2005 when social scientists, civil society members, UN Agency members, lawyers, psychologists, social workers, senior police officers and field police officers met to discuss the nature and extent of the VAW problem and how to address it. They decided that placing women constables on the beat in targeted areas was both effective and cost-effective. Over the next year or two they tested the idea of women constables on the beat in the area most affected by high rates of violence against women, particularly rape (the North West District).

The effort was also collaborative in terms of communications between various departments to improve the delivery of existing services. For instance, many female victims were unaware of the law and access to free legal aid, Women Help Lines, counselling centres and facilities for battered women. Therefore integrated into this effort were departments and NGOs working together to both increase community awareness of these facilities and build cooperation between those providing services and the community.

Departments and stakeholders also cooperated in terms of organising awareness activities to sensitise society to the problem and to point to solutions. For instance, in the entire city of 15 million people, only 4-6% of all rapes owed to strangers while more than 95% were committed by boyfriends, neighbours and relatives (as is the case in South Africa). This increased awareness of risk also assisted those at risk to seek out help.

Success Rates

This was not a fully evaluated effort (no baseline study was undertaken) but the crime data showed a major drop in crime in the targeted areas. The data available on the Delhi Police Website shows:

- A near 18% drop in rape cases in the targeted Northwest District between 2005 and 2007 (190 cases down to 156)
- The above contributed to an overall 10% drop in rape stats in New Delhi from a high of 658 per year in in 2005 to 598 cases in 2007³⁷

Since most of this drop in New Delhi owed to the drop in the Northwest District (an area of about 3 million people)—which had been the largest contributor to rape cases in New Delhi—the pilot was deemed highly successful. Furthermore, until the pilot project, rape had been increasing at 18% per year for four consecutive years. Suddenly it dropped 18% in the targeted area.

³⁷ Delhi Police Website: <http://www.delhipolice.nic.in/parivartan/parivartan.htm>

The perception of success is also important and it was regarded as so successful that after piloting in 2005-2006, it was institutionalised between September 2006 and March 2007 in the Northwest District of Delhi. The model is now diffusing around Delhi and throughout India while also being studied from abroad. It also won some international recognition including:

- The Webber Seavey Award in 2006 *Issued by the International Association of Police Chiefs)
- Selected by the United National Development Programme as among the ten best international practices in crime reduction
- Recognition by the Gender Institute of the London School of Economics and Political Science³⁸
- A 2007 review by internal and external expert confirming a negative growth in the incidence of rape that can be attributed to the project
- A documentary film was released in August 2006 to try to capture the success

³⁸ Kumar, Ashok (20 March 2007) 'Three Cheers for Parivartan' The Hindu, <http://www.hindu.com/2007/03/20/stories>

3. MOBILE DOMESTIC VIOLENCE RESPONSE UNITS

Mobile Domestic Violence Response Units go along with hotlines so that as soon as a serious case is reported, a team of specially trained personnel can be dispatched quickly to the scene. While this system is found in many parts of the world, it occurs mainly in urban areas (e.g., Salisbury, England; San Francisco, California, Buenos Aires). It is also a trend more common to rich or middle income countries than poor ones. Training and equipping such units is initially expensive and in every country where it has been tried, it has been partnership driven to help cover these costs (e.g., the Department of Justice, police and NGOs might collaborate). However, when considering expense one must also bear in mind that in most countries domestic violence accounts for the majority of police time (e.g., one-third of the cases in the United States³⁹; more than 70% of the cases in Argentina⁴⁰). In other words, this expense may be justified: time is freed to handle other criminal activities.

One example from a middle income country like South Africa is found in Argentina where in 2006 piloting started with two mobile units working 24-hours-a-day in Buenos Aires.⁴¹ This system was officially launched in March 2007 when the first emergency call to a toll-free line on VAW led to dispatching a mobile unit.⁴² These mobile units have now been operating for six years since then with about 70 professionals (lawyers, justice employees, social workers, psychologists, and doctors) and 55 specially trained police officers involved in the hotline dispatch of these.⁴³ This is also a country that has all-women police stations--these models are compatible and not mutually exclusive.

³⁹ Burnett, Lynn Barkley (28 November 2011) <http://emedicine.medscape.com/article/805546-overview>

⁴⁰ Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada Research Directorate (17 January 2008), "Argentina: Women Victims of domestic violence, state protection and resources available to victims,"; *La Nación* 3 Dec. 2007; *El Siglo* 29 Sept. 2007.

⁴¹ US Department of State (2006) Country Reports: Argentina, <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2006/78877.htm>

⁴² UNHCR (17 January 2008) <http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/refworld/rwmain?docid=47ce6d7ca>

⁴³ UNHCR (17 January 2008) <http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/refworld/rwmain?docid=47ce6d7ca>; U.S. Department of State (2010) Human Rights Report on Argentina, <http://www.state.gov/j/drl/rls/hrrpt/2010/wha/154491.htm>

If Buenos Aires can manage mobile units, is it feasible for South Africa to consider piloting this in one or two cities since it does not appear to have tried such a system? It seems reasonable since:

- South Africa and Argentina are both middle income countries of around the same GDP per capita (\$5000) and manage about the same sized population
- Both countries also suffer from high levels of domestic violence and need to be innovative about solving this⁴⁴
- Like South Africa, Argentina also has nationally organised police and they worked with the Department of the Interior and the City of Buenos Aires to try this out such that it has become a sustained practice that is also about to be replicated across the country
- Edgar's is already piloting a similar police-partnership project in Johannesburg except that they locate these units in busy commercial zones where people on the street can access these facilities easily for a rapid response

The basic success in Argentina is that the mobile units overcame the challenge of creating effective cross-disciplinary partnerships, which had been extremely slow to develop initially (as in South Africa).⁴⁵ With the mobile units, coordination between various departments (e.g., Health, Justice, and Police), civil society and other networks was achieved by putting representatives from each department together into mobile units and sending them to the crime scene! It is very difficult NOT to have cross-disciplinary PARTNERSHIPS when travelling to the scene of a crime in the same vehicle day after day. Thus, even if it only works in some areas, it: (a) furnishes some excellent training; (b) provides a meaningful service; and (c) acts as

⁴⁴ Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada Research Directorate (17 January 2008), "Argentina: Women Victims of domestic violence, state protection and resources available to victims," *La Nación* 3 Dec. 2007; *El Siglo* 29 Sept. 2007.

⁴⁵ Argentine Republic (@2007) Response to Special Session of the General Assembly, <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/review/response/argentina>

a deterrent to violence against women since apprehension of the abuser occurs at a more frequent rate—many times he is still on the scene or nearby.

Getting appropriate expertise to the crime scene as fast as possible also aims to achieve the following outcomes:

- Victims maintaining the complaint rather than dropping the charges
- Perpetrators caught and restrained if necessary
- Victims moved as rapidly as possible to health centres to receive immediate attention
- Forensic data immediately collected which helps with successful prosecutions
- Victims receiving immediate support from trained psychologists
- More successful investigations because ‘a hot trail is better than a cold one’⁴⁶

Organisation And Management Of Mobile Domestic Violence Units

How does it work? The process starts when either a victim or a neighbour calls the number ‘137’ and speaks to an attendant who then dispatches a mobile unit consisting of two police officers, one psychologist and one social worker who arrive on the scene together within 20 minutes of the call.⁴⁷ The key is that all the significant emergency service providers come to the victim rather than asking the victim to know about, locate, and request services in the aftermath of violence.

⁴⁶ Agenda de las Mujeres (14 June 2006)

<http://translate.google.com/translate?hl=en&sl=es&u=http://agendadelasmujeres.com.ar/notadesplegada.php%3Fid%3D2432&sa=X&oi=translate&resnum=5&ct=result&prev=/search%3Fq%3DArgentina%2BBrigada%2BM%25C3%25B3vil%2B%26start%3D20%26hl%3Den%26sa%3DN>

⁴⁷ Videla, Eduardo (11 May 2007) ‘A Flying Squad in Emergency Cases of Family Violence’;

http://www.mujireshoy.com/secc_n/3689.shtml&sa=X&oi=translate&resnum=4&ct=result&prev=/search%3Fq%3DArgentina%2BBrigada%2BM%25C3%25B3vil%2B%26hl%3Den%26sa%3DG

The organisation of the teams was undertaken by a national commission which falls under the Department of the Interior called 'Comisarías de la Mujer' which pays for the teams of lawyers, psychologists and social workers to support victims while police activities come from the police budget.

FIGURE FIVE (below) illustrates some other details on the organisation of the Mobile Domestic Violence Units, which take about six months to set up:

FIGURE FIVE
ARGENTINA'S MANAGEMENT OF MOBILE DOMESTIC VIOLENCE UNITS

DELIVERY OF SERVICES	MANAGEMENT	COLLABORATION	ESTABLISHED	MAIN ISSUES ADDRESSED
A mobile unit of two police members, 1 psychologist and a social worker	Ministry of the Interior with City of Buenos Aires and Police	Gender Policy Officer, Commission of the Woman and Family, A Domestic Violence Bureau (opened in 2007) provides legal, psychological and medical services to all victims of domestic violence	August 2006	All forms of Domestic Violence and child abuse

Collaboration

The mobile units are not really a stand-alone strategy and include the AWPS (the first topic discussed) and a mix of partners from civil society, government and the police involved in a broad range of activities. It is perhaps the weight of all the efforts combined that produce success. However, the mobile units alone also involve many contributions and strategic components including:

- **FINANCING AND RESOURCES:** mainly from the Interior Ministry, the National Police, and the City of Buenos Aires through its ‘Victims Against Violence Programme’
- **TRAINING AND INFORMATION/AWARENESS PROGRAMMES:** provided by National Women’s Departments, units and councils (e.g., Gender Policy, Commission on Women and Family, National Women’s Council) and civil society groups—*this is key to increasing reporting levels*
- **INTERDISCIPLINARY TEAMS:** various departments including Police, Health, and civil society offer technical support and assistance
- **CIVIL SOCIETY:** monitoring, partnering and it was really their demand on government to defend women’s rights, pay more attention to women’s issues, and educate women about their rights that led to the entire programme⁴⁸

Success Rates

The mobile units are successful when measured in terms of (a) improved reporting levels; (b) more rapid response times, and (c) the quick apprehension of offenders.⁴⁹ They have not reduced Argentina’s overall domestic violence figures, which rose in 2010 (a complex phenomenon, however as increased reporting levels can also indicate success).⁵⁰ The biggest problem with VAW anywhere including Argentina and South Africa is that reporting levels are low compared to the indicated and

⁴⁸ Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (17 January 2008) Argentina: Women Victims of Domestic Violence, <http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/refworld/rwmain?docid=47ce6d7ca>

⁴⁹ Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (17 January 2008) Argentina: Women Victims of Domestic Violence, <http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/refworld/rwmain?docid=47ce6d7ca>

⁵⁰ The Argentina Independent (04 May 2011) ‘Abuse at Home, Violence Against Women in Argentina’, <http://www.argentinaindependent.com/socialissues/urbanlife/abuse-at-home-violence-against-women-in-argentina/>

estimated levels of violence.⁵¹ The mobile units did increase reporting levels and had an impact on the crime statistics (see below).

Domestic violence reporting increased during the time of implementing the mobile units. During the first nine months of 2007, there was a 57 per cent rise in domestic violence complaints over the same period in 2006, and 28 per cent of complaints included reports of physical violence while 21 per cent involved reports of threats of violence.⁵² This cannot be attributed to the mobile units alone because they are part of an entire strategy that includes dedicated phone lines and awareness campaigns regarding those facilities. The programme is also challenged by a lack of women's shelters and problems of financing such that it is limited to Buenos Aires. There is also very little data so far on success.

Training

There is little or no training but rather careful selection of highly trained personnel. These are essentially 'flying squads' composed of a psychologist, a social worker and two police members. Thus, the qualifications for the role are of a high standard. Team-building efforts are more appropriate but this occurred in piloting.

Resources

The main resources are vans equipped with forensic equipment and teams of experts (2 police, a social worker, and a psychologist).

⁵¹ Only about 657 cases were reported in 2010 and yet about 4 women a week died from domestic violence, which is just one line of evidence to indicate low reporting <http://www.argentinaindependent.com/socialissues/urbanlife/abuse-at-home-violence-against-women-in-argentina/>

⁵² Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (17 January 2008) Argentina: Women Victims of Domestic Violence, <http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/refworld/rwmain?docid=47ce6d7ca>

EXTRACTING THE LEARNING FROM THREE PRACTICES

In general one can say that all three reviewed practices were innovative efforts that shifted organizational culture toward an integrated multi-disciplinary approach involving collaboration between key departments and stakeholders. This is ultimately what the IICG seeks rather than any particular model. Owing to the size of the problem much extensive collaboration is required from the top levels of government to the streets and communities of South Africa. Yet this full level of collaboration from national level departments to the constable on the beat was shown to be one of the weakest areas of South African Practice (see Figure One).

In terms of extracting more specific lessons, itemized and discussed briefly below are seven lessons that should apply to any practice and this is followed by a brief conclusion. The seven practices that seem to be part of winning formulas are:

1) Integrated plans on VAW from a national level to a local level

This allows for:

- Better Training opportunities
- Access to national resources like forensic laboratories
- Consistent management of staff
- Strategic management (protocols)
- Interdisciplinary teams from across departments
- Monitoring and evaluation

Especially notable in all three reviewed efforts was strong backing from a national level (often a Department devoted to Women's Issues) even though piloting and roll-out occurred in targeted areas.

2) Key Female Agents of Change in National Ministries

Not only was there drive from national but in all three cases National Ministries for Women devoted to and driving the efforts.

3) A multitude of inputs all at once

Multi-pronged strategies that tackle the problem from many different angles are more effective than just one strategy (i.e. most of the countries discussed today integrated all three of the strategies).

4) Rapid Response

Rapid responses are an essential part of any workable programme since this leads to: (a) maintaining the charge; (b) better evidence collection; and (c) apprehending the perpetrator. *Note: by law in Chile and Argentina, police must respond within a required time (usually minutes).* Good services can be offered even in the poorest of countries if there is good cooperation between departments and a commitment to rapid, efficient service.

5) A scientific approach that includes Monitoring and Evaluation

All three projects described engaged constant monitoring and evaluation. Ideas were not just adapted in one setting and laid down in the next as law but carefully piloted and developed over fairly long periods of time. In Chile an entire government department exists just for monitoring and evaluating such projects and programmes.

6) Civil society advocacy of what works

In all three cases civil society organisation provided the push for government to do something innovative about the problem since the ordinary ways of working had not been reducing the levels of VAW. Civil Society mainly provided the research

information and the advocacy but without this not one of the described efforts would have taken off.

7) Constant Training of police and partners

Training was not just once off for any of these efforts but an integrated part of the effort itself and constant. It was also integrated into regular police training. We also saw that women did not have to wait on training to have an impact before getting some level of service. 'Women on the Beat' in India was not perceived as a permanent arrangement but something to do while training and culture change was taking place in India. Even in the All Women Police Stations, one finds some sensitive men working and gradually the model was even yielding the rapid response units in which all sensitive and trained members arrive on the scene of the crime. This evolution shows that innovation does not stop but is on-going.

A BRIEF CONCLUSION

In conclusion, one can extract from the three models basic practices that apply to any effort and perhaps reflecting on what is happening elsewhere can stimulate thinking here without being prescriptive. All three methods led to increases in reporting, however, and this might be something to look at in South Africa. If we actually developed a systematic way to drive down levels of VAW, can our criminal justice system (police, courts, and prisons) handle a 100% increase in reporting? A great deal of teamwork and cross-disciplinary cooperation went into the described efforts and all were driven and coordinated from national level. Furthermore, the reason for that national-level strategy and drive came (initially) from strong lobbying and advocacy campaigns to engage in some innovation to address the problem since the existing practices were not so effective.